

**From:** JANE SMITH [<mailto:j.m.smith@btinternet.com>]  
**Sent:** 12 August 2014 09:10  
**To:** Rory Collins  
**Cc:** Jane Armitage; Colin Baigent  
**Subject:** Letter to BMJ panel

Dear Rory

I have now consulted Iona. She and the panel are committed to an open dialogue.

If you would like to pursue this matter please send a rapid response either to Fiona's editorial or to the panel's report, which will shortly be published as a full article on [thebmj.com](http://thebmj.com).

If you have any problems submitting the letter with its attachments, The BMJ's letters editor Sharon Davies will be able to help ([sdavies@bmj.com](mailto:sdavies@bmj.com)).

Best wishes

Jane

Jane Smith  
Secretary to the panel

**From:** Cathy Harwood **On Behalf Of** Rory Collins  
**Sent:** 08 August 2014 13:32  
**To:** 'Fiona Godlee'; [iona.heath22@yahoo.co.uk](mailto:iona.heath22@yahoo.co.uk)  
**Cc:** Iain Chalmers; 'Virginia Barbour'; JANE SMITH ([j.m.smith@btinternet.com](mailto:j.m.smith@btinternet.com)); Jane Armitage; Colin Baigent  
**Subject:** FW: Re: Letter to BMJ panel

Dear Fiona and Iona

The attached letter and related materials were submitted by us to the BMJ's panel for their consideration as part of the rationale for withdrawing the papers by Abramson et al and by Malhotra.

As indicated in our cover letter, this submission is directly relevant to the rationale for withdrawing those papers (rather than publishing a partial correction of just one of the major errors) and it was necessarily submitted after the BMJ's deadline for submission of the materials since it relates to the "open letter" that was sent after that deadline to NICE and the Secretary of State for Health by Aseem Malhotra and his colleagues, in which errors in the original BMJ papers were repeated and extended.

However, we notice that these materials have not been included with the other submissions to the panel on the BMJ website (some of which were also submitted after the BMJ's rather tight deadline). We should be most grateful, therefore, if you could arrange for these materials to be added to the other submissions on the website in accordance with the terms of reference for the review.

Best wishes.

Jane Armitage, Colin Baigent and Rory Collins